

Membership of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee

2013-14

Members

Cllr Martin Love, (Chair).
Cllr Kevin Warnes, (Deputy Chair).
Cllr Michael McCabe.
Cllr Zameer Shah.
Cllr Adrian Farley.
Cllr Sarah Ferriby.
Cllr Ghazanfer Khaliq.
Cllr Alun Griffiths.
Cllr David Robinson.

Co-Opted Members

Julia Pearson – Bradford Environmental Forum.
Nicola Hoggart – Environment Agency.
Ian Butterfield – Bradford Environmental Trust.

Alternate Members

Cllr Michael Ellis.
Cllr Val Townend.
Cllr Nazam Azam.
Cllr Arshad Hussain.
Cllr Gill Thornton.
Cllr David Gray.
Cllr Hawarun Hussain.

Contact for Enquiries

Mustansir Butt
Overview and Scrutiny Lead
E-mail: mustansir.butt@bradford.gov.uk
Tel (01274) 432574

2014-15

Members

Cllr Martin Love, (Chair).
Cllr Kevin Warnes, (Deputy Chair).
Cllr Michael McCabe.
Cllr Michael Walls.
Cllr Adrian Farley.
Cllr Sarah Ferriby.
Cllr Mohammed Shafiq.
Cllr Alun Griffiths.
Cllr David Robinson.

Co-Opted Members

Julia Pearson – Bradford Environmental Forum.
Nicola Hoggart – Environment Agency.

Alternate Members

Cllr Michael Ellis.
Cllr Val Townend.
Cllr Nazam Azam.
Cllr Ruth Billheimer.
Cllr Gill Thornton.
Cllr Rachel Sunderland.
Cllr Hawarun Hussain.

Contents

Section	Page Number
Chair's Foreword.	4
Executive Summary.	5
Chapter 1 – Introduction.	7
Chapter 2 – Local Context.	8
Chapter 3 – Key Findings.	9
Chapter 4 – Concluding Remarks.	14
Appendices	
Appendix 1 – Terms of Reference.	
Appendix 2 – Hearings and witnesses.	

Chairs Foreword

I am pleased to present this report, a detailed scrutiny review into the people killed and seriously injured on the District's roads.

This report has been instigated by a meeting of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee, at its meeting on Thursday 11 July 2013. The Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered a report relating to, the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership end of year Performance Report 2012-13.

Members expressed concern at the area of underperformance relating to the number of people "killed or seriously injured" in road traffic accidents.

Subsequently the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee requested that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee.

Members of the committee have engaged with a range of interested parties and all have made valuable contributions to the work of this Committee.

As Chair of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, I hope this document gives you an insight into road safety across the District, along with how the current measures being taken to tackle road safety can be further improved.

I would like to thank all consultees who made a valuable input to this review.

I would like to thank the members of the committee for their sustained commitment throughout this process, as well as officers who have supported the committee throughout the Scrutiny Review.

Councillor Martin Love
Chair, Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee

Executive Summary

This report has been instigated by a meeting of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee. On Thursday 11 July 2013, the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered a report relating to, the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership end of year Performance Report 2012-13.

Members expressed concern at the area of underperformance relating to the number of people “killed or seriously injured” in road traffic accidents.

Subsequently the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee requested that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee.

However during the course of this Scrutiny Review, members have learned that there are in fact significant discrepancies in the manner in which related data is collected and recorded. Subsequently, this Scrutiny Review has made recommendations for improvement in this area.

This review also highlights that casualties across the District’s roads are static, nevertheless members of the Committee feel that one death is one too many and the good work that is being undertaken by Officers to reduce casualties across the District, should not only be sustained but improved further and resources allocated to Road Safety should reflect this accordingly.

The information gathering sessions as part of this Scrutiny Review highlighted a number of areas for improvement. These areas included:

- Distribution of Road Safety Funding;
- Data Collection and Performance Reporting;
- Education and Training;
- Resources for Road Safety across the Bradford District.

Subsequently, this Committee has made a number of recommendations for improvement, which are set out below.

Recommendation 1

The Committee recommends that Bradford Council’s Road Safety Team with Schools and the Police, continue to take proactive steps in reducing pedal cyclist casualties by delivering:

- the safety aspects of Bradford Council’s Cycling Strategy;
- greater road awareness training to pedal cyclists.

Recommendation 2

The Committee recommends that the Executive considers that funding for road safety schemes and initiatives should be based on areas of need across the Bradford District where casualties are higher, rather than being distributed to Area Committees on a Per Capita basis.

Recommendation 3

The Committee recommends that Bradford Council's Traffic and Highways Team and Corporate Performance Officers work towards the annual reporting of people that are killed and seriously injured on the District's roads, rather than the quarterly reporting that currently exists.

Recommendation 4

The Committee recommends that the appropriate officers agree the period of duration for the reporting of casualties across the Bradford District and ensure that this is reflected in previous years' statistics for comparison when presented in future reports.

Recommendation 5

The Committee recommends that officers from Bradford Councils Road Safety Team and from Public Health reach an agreement over the age of a child for the purposes of collecting casualty figures for children across Bradford District's roads.

Recommendation 6

The Committee recommends that education and training for road safety should continue to be delivered across the whole of the Bradford District and this should be reflected in the funding allocated to Bradford Councils Road Safety Team. Such education and training should be a multi-agency approach with key partners such as Public Health, Schools and West Yorkshire Police.

Recommendation 7

The Committee recommends that the Executive continues support for the funding of Bradford Councils Road Safety Team and that any future proposed changes to Road Safety funding are brought to the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, for its consideration and review.

Recommendation 8

Bradford Council's Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee to receive a report back in 12 months, which monitors progress against all the recommendations contained within this Scrutiny Review.

Chapter 1 - Introduction

Background

At its meeting on Thursday 11 July 2013, the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered a report relating to, the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership end of year Performance Report 2012-13.

Members expressed concerns at the area of underperformance relating to the reduction in number of people “killed or seriously injured” in road traffic accidents.

Subsequently the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee requested that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee and resolved that:

“Having considered Document “D”, Members are concerned with the area of underperformance relating to the reduction in number of “killed or seriously injured” in road traffic accidents and that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee”.

The Committee’s terms of Reference are attached as appendix 1.

The Scrutiny Process

Members have received and gathered a range of information from a number of different sources, including:

- discussions with Bradford Council Officers, (Traffic & Highways, Road Safety and Public Health);
- a review of documents and data.

Overall Aims

The key aims of this Scrutiny Review are to:

- establish a picture of road traffic casualty trends within the Bradford district (in comparison to regional trends);
- explore levels and variances across different areas of the District;
- review historical and ongoing road safety interventions activities carried out by the Council and its key partners;
- explore the robustness of related data;
- examine the differences in the reporting mechanisms for Public Health and Highways;
- take account of local inequalities in Bradford;
- consider future road safety priorities;
- explore funding for safer roads.

Chapter 2 – Local Context

Setting the Scene

Bradford Council has a Casualty Reduction supporting indicator in line with the West Yorkshire Local Transport Plan's target of 50% reduction, in the number of people Killed or Seriously Injured (KSI) by 2026.

For the Bradford district this is based on a reduction from the 2005-09 average of 248, to 124 KSI's. This equates to reducing the number of KSI's by 8.3 per year. The target for 2012 was 212 KSI's; the actual number was 221.

The tables below set-out in greater detail the casualties across the Bradford district, from 2002 to 2013.

Table 1 – All casualties across the Bradford District 2002 – 2013

	2002	2003	2004	2005	2006	2007	2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013
Fatal	26	15	20	26	23	27	19	21	10	12	15	13
Serious	253	284	245	222	229	228	255	190	198	204	206	177
Slight	3110	2905	2734	2368	2448	2211	2097	2131	1881	1664	1745	1485
Total	3389	3204	2999	2616	2700	2466	2371	2342	2089	1880	1966	1672

There are also the local Corporate Indicators (NI47, NI48) relating to child KSIs and all KSIs.

Comparisons against other West Yorkshire Authorities

	Bradford	Calderdale	Kirklees	Leeds	Wakefield
Fatal	13	4	13	15	10
Serious	177	86	127	279	140
Slight	1485	476	1073	2139	769
Total	1672	566	1213	2433	919

Chapter 3 – Key Findings

This section presents the findings of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, as a result of this Scrutiny Review of people killed and seriously injured on Bradford District's roads.

During the information gathering sessions with interested parties members learned about the casualty trends across the District, the effectiveness of performance measures, funding arrangements for Road Safety and methods being used to reduce the numbers of people that are killed and seriously injured across the District's roads.

Members of the Committee held information gathering sessions with officers from Bradford Council's Road Safety Team and Public Health, along with the Principal Highway Engineer from Bradford Council.

The transcripts from the information gathering sessions are available on request.

The findings of this scrutiny review will now be explored in more detail.

During the course of the information gathering sessions, members of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny learned that from 2002 to 2012, casualties for pedestrians, motor cyclists and car occupants had decreased. However, for the same period casualties to pedal cyclists had increased from 116 in 2002 to 122 in 2012. Moreover members also heard that over the same period, the number of cyclists also increased.

Even though this appears to be a marginal increase, members were concerned about the increase in injuries to pedal cyclists and felt that more should be done to reduce the injuries.

Recommendation 1

The Committee recommends that Bradford Council's Road Safety Team continue to take proactive steps in reducing the injuries to pedal cyclists by delivering:

- **the safety aspects of Bradford Council's Cycling Strategy;**
- **greater road awareness training to pedal cyclists.**

Distribution of Road Safety Funding

When setting the terms of reference for this Scrutiny Review, members of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee were unanimous in wanting to explore the distribution of funding arrangements for Road Safety across the District.

Bradford Council officers informed members that the West Yorkshire Transport Plan sets out the capital programme for the District over the next 15 years, which is based around the movement of transport in a sustainable and safe fashion and that is for the whole of West Yorkshire of which Bradford gets a proportion. The money is then distributed through the Executive, to the Area Committees.

Bradford Council would receive 23%, (insert actual figure here) of the £13.2m which has been allocated to the whole of West Yorkshire for Road Safety schemes.

Here members learned that whilst funding was being spread geographically, it was not being concentrated in the hotspots across the District and being targeted to the areas with the greatest of need. Road Safety monies across the five West Yorkshire authorities were in fact allocated on per head of population.

Members of the Committee explored this further by questioning if the money for Road Safety was spread evenly between Area Committees or if it is allocated in relation to accident hotspots.

Subsequently, members heard that it would be Bradford Council Officers who would provide a list of Road Safety schemes to Area Committees, which would be delivered from monies allocated through the West Yorkshire Local Transport Plan. Furthermore, these Road Safety Schemes are based around driving down the numbers of people killed and seriously injured across the District.

Moreover, members were concerned to hear that an Area Committee could actually refuse to agree a particular Road Safety Scheme in its area, as they may have their own ideas on what the money should be spent on. This was a risk, particularly as the money for the project could be lost completely if the Council deviates too far from the project.

Recommendation 2

The Committee recommends that the Executive considers that funding for road safety schemes and initiatives should be based on areas of need across the Bradford District where casualties are higher, rather than being distributed to Area Committees on a Per Capita basis.

Data Collection and Performance Reporting

The primary reason for undertaking this Scrutiny Review was due to a meeting on Thursday 11 July 2013, of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee. At the meeting, it considered a report relating to the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership end of year Performance Report 2012-13.

Members expressed concern at the area of underperformance relating to the number of people “killed or seriously injured” in road traffic accidents.

Subsequently the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee requested that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee.

However members heard from Bradford Council’s Principle Engineer that the Council was in fact making good progress in reducing casualty rates across the whole of the District and that casualty rates were not as high as stated. Moreover the problem here is actually with the reporting mechanisms used. The Corporate Performance Unit report casualty data on a quarterly basis, which members heard is not meaningful.

Bradford Council's Principle Engineer explained to members that it would be more meaningful if casualty data for people that are killed and seriously injured on the Districts roads was presented on an annual basis rather than quarterly basis as you would reduce the seasonal change impact. For instance there may have been more people killed and seriously injured in the second quarter, hence one incident could skew the figures.

Recommendation 3

The Committee recommends that Bradford Council's Traffic and Highways Team and Corporate Performance Officers work towards the annual reporting of people that are killed and seriously injured on the District's roads, rather than the quarterly reporting that currently exists.

Furthermore, during the course of the information gathering sessions for this Scrutiny review, members of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee were alarmed to learn about the inaccuracy of casualty reporting data, particularly from Bradford Council and the Community Safety Partnership.

Members were informed by Bradford Council's Principal Engineer that Bradford Councils Corporate centre reports on casualties from April to April, whereas the Traffic and Highways Team report casualties from January to January. Therefore, there is never going to be a perfect match of casualties across the District at any given time.

With regards to this issue, members of the Committee were in agreement that there needs to be greater synergy relating to the collection and reporting of casualty rates between the different bodies, in order for this information to be used in a meaningful manner to reduce the numbers of people that are killed and seriously injured on the District's roads.

Recommendation 4

The Committee recommends that the appropriate officers agree the period of duration for the reporting of casualties across the Bradford District and ensure that this is reflected in previous years' statistics when presented in future reports.

Members also learned that there were also discrepancies in how different bodies reported casualty rates for children. For instance the Principle Highway Engineer stated that Bradford Council would refer to a child as being under 16, whereas officers in Public Health would refer to a child as being under 18.

Once again, members of the Environmental and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee were alarmed to discover this discrepancy in the data, as inaccurate data would not be measurable and could not really be used to reduce the rates for children across the District.

Recommendation 5

The Committee recommends that officers from Bradford Council's Road Safety Team and from Public Health, reach an agreement over the age of a child for the purposes of collecting casualty figures for children across Bradford District's roads.

Education and Training

Members of the Committee heard from officers from Bradford Council and Public Health about recognising, understanding and addressing the multitude of reasons that influence casualties in the Bradford District.

Education and training publicity is imperative if casualties across the District are to be further reduced. Facilities and transport infrastructure can be built, but if people are not taught how to use those facilities then it will be difficult to reduce casualties further across the District.

Members of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee could not emphasise enough the importance of education and training across the Bradford District in reducing casualties across the District. Whilst members appreciated that casualties are generally reducing, one death was still too many and the efforts to further educate and train people across the whole of the District should be rigorously continued.

During the course of this Scrutiny Review, members of the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee ascertained that the incidence of people across the District that are killed and seriously injured is random in nature and there are incidents all over the District.

Nevertheless, information presented by Bradford Council's Principal Highway Engineer illustrated that people are more likely to be killed or seriously injured on the District's roads in the Inner City areas of the District. This is also further supported by Government information which states that the more deprived areas have higher levels of people killed and seriously injured; so high that a child is 20 times more likely to be killed or seriously injured in those areas than those with the lowest rates.

Members of the Committee felt that this was a significant issue and one where the balance needed to be addressed.

This area was explored further and it was revealed that casualties for children in the more affluent areas was much lower, mainly due to less traffic flow, greater supervision and children having more chance to do play activity outside in a safer environment; compared than the Inner City areas of the District where exposure to risk is greater.

Recommendation 6

The Committee recommends that education and training for road safety should continue to be delivered across the whole of the Bradford District and this should be reflected in the funding allocated to Bradford Councils Road Safety Team. Such education and training should be a multi-agency approach with key partners such as Public Health, Schools and West Yorkshire Police.

Resources for Road Safety across the Bradford District

During the information gathering sessions for this scrutiny review, members heard about the importance of the work undertaken by the Road Safety Team in reducing casualties across the Bradford District.

In discussions with the Principal Highways Engineer and Road Safety Manager, it was highlighted that with all the building of highways infrastructure, people needed to be given the tools to behave in the appropriate manner to reduce casualties. The role of educating, training and publicity in reducing casualties is of paramount importance.

Members were also informed that there have been reductions in resources for Road Safety Teams across some parts of the country, which has resulted in casualties in those areas increasing.

Moreover, Bradford Councils Road Safety Manager indicated that there were currently 3.5 equivalent staff in the team to cover the whole of the Bradford District. Members were alarmed to discover that if the Road Safety Team was no longer in operation, it would take approximately five years to develop and to get something like where the team is now with regards to specific Road Safety training that is being delivered across the District, for instance pedestrian training in schools.

The Road Safety Team provides a district wide service delivering education training and publicity programmes. Children are a priority for the Road Safety Team and are identified in the City of Bradford Metropolitan District Road Safety Plan. Adult road safety education is also covered. There are many outputs and outcomes from the deliverables in the Road safety Plan, which coincide with outcomes in the Public Health Outcomes Framework, (PHOF).

The specific PHOF indicators are:

- killed and seriously injured on England's roads;
- hospital admissions caused by unintentional and deliberate injuries in children, (0-14 years);
- hospital admissions caused by unintentional and deliberate injuries in children and young people, (15-24).

The Committee learned that that Bradford Councils Road Safety Team is funded from the Public Health Grant, from April 2014 onwards.

Recommendation 7

The Committee recommends that the Executive continues support for the funding of Bradford Councils Road Safety Team and that any future proposed changes to Road Safety funding are brought to the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, for its consideration and review

Chapter 4 – Concluding Remarks

In its deliberations this committee has endeavoured to take a balanced approach to this Scrutiny Review and one that encompasses the views and concerns of all interested parties.

The Scrutiny Review report has a number of recommendations, which if implemented would further assist in reducing the numbers of people killed and seriously injured on the District's roads.

Bradford Council's Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, will monitor progress against the Scrutiny Review recommendations annually.

Recommendation 8

Bradford Council's Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee to receive a report back in 12 months which monitors progress against all the recommendations contained within this Scrutiny Review.

**City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council
Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee**

Scrutiny Review of people killed or seriously injured on Bradford Districts Roads

Terms of Reference

See Part 3E paragraphs 2.1 to 2.11 of the Constitution of the Council.

Background

At its meeting on Thursday 11 July 2013, the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee considered a report relating to, the Bradford District Community Safety Partnership end of year Performance Report 2012-13.

Members expressed concerned at the area of underperformance relating to the reduction in number of people “killed or seriously injured” in road traffic accidents.

Subsequently the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee requested that the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee undertakes a scrutiny review into this and reports back their findings to this Committee.

Context

The Council has a Reduction supporting indicator in line with the West Yorkshire Local Transport Plan’s target of 50% reduction, in the number of people Killed or Seriously Injured (KSI) by 2026.

For the Bradford district this is based on a reduction from the 2005-09 average of 248, to 124 KSI’s. This equates to reducing the number of KSI’s by 8.3 per year. The target for 2012 was 212 KSI’s; the actual number was 221.

There are also the local Corporate Indicators (NI47, NI48) relating to child KSIs and all KSIs.

Key Lines of Enquiry

The key lines of enquiry for this scrutiny review are to:

- establish a picture of road traffic trends within the Bradford district (in comparison to regional and national trends);
- explore levels and variances across different areas of the District;
- review historical and ongoing Safer Roads interventions activities carried out by the Council and its key partners;
- explore the robustness of related data;
- examine the differences in the reporting mechanisms for Public Health and Highways;
- take account of local inequalities with levels in Bradford;
- consider future Safer Roads priorities;
- explore funding for safer roads.

Methodology

The committee will receive and consider a variety of evidence/information provided by a range of interested parties. The Committee may adopt one or more of the following methods to collect evidence/information:

- relevant documents;
- relevant data;
- written submissions from, or meetings with interested parties;
- undertake relevant visits.

Indicative list of interested parties

An indicative list of interested parties is provided below. This is not definitive or exclusive and can be developed as the scrutiny progresses.

Organisation / Department	Contact
Portfolio Holder – Bradford Council.	Cllr Andrew Thornton, (Environment, Sport and Sustainability).
Portfolio Holder – Bradford Council.	Cllr Val Slater, (Housing, Planning and Transport).
Bradford Council - Traffic & Highways.	Simon D'Vali and Andrew Smith.
Bradford Council - Road Safety.	Sue Snoddy.
West Yorkshire Police.	Inspector Dorian James.
Public Health.	Shirley Brierley and Jonnie Dance.
Safer Communities Partnership.	Rebecca Trueman.
Bradford Council.	Members of the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

Indicative Timetable

Date	Milestone
Tuesday 5 November 2013.	DRAFT Terms of Reference to be presented to the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee – for discussion and approval.
Thursday 12 December 2013.	Information gathering session – setting the scene.
Friday 31 January 2014.	Information gathering session – hotspots and funding.
June 2014.	Final Draft Report – to be presented to the Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
July 2014.	Final Draft report – to be presented to the Corporate Overview and Scrutiny Committee.

Information Gathering Sessions

Session 1 – Thursday 12 December 2013 – setting the scene.

Councillor Martin Love.	Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, (Chair).
Councillor Sarah Ferriby.	Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
Councillor Michael McCabe.	Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
Simon D'Vali.	Principal Engineer, (Highway), Bradford Council.
Mustansir Butt.	Overview and Scrutiny Lead, Bradford Council.

Session 2 – Friday 31 January 2014 – hotspots and funding.

Councillor Martin Love.	Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee, (Chair).
Councillor Sarah Ferriby.	Environment and Waste Management Overview and Scrutiny Committee.
Simon D'Vali.	Principal Engineer, (Highway), Bradford Council.
Sue Snoddy.	Road Safety Team, Bradford Council.
Shirley Brierley.	Consultant, Public Health
Andy Snell.	Registrar, Public Health.
Mustansir Butt.	Overview and Scrutiny Lead, Bradford Council.